A Follow Up Source Sheet Supplement for the Pre-Yizkor Sermon on Yom Kippur: On Brokenness Rabbi Eliot Malomet September 30, 2023 15 Tishrei 5784

Entering the "Zone of Memory" prior to Yizkor on Yom Kippur, we have a feeling of brokenness. It is augmented by the brokenness we are witnessing after 10 months of weekly protests in Israel, and the 50th anniversary of the Yom Kippur War. The veterans of that war are a particular study in brokenness. Despite winning that war, it shattered Israel's soul. Post Six-Day-War Israel was jubilant and triumphant. Post Yom-Kippur-War Israel was introspective and reserved. Veterans of the Yom Kippur War are playing a prominent role in the current protests. They fought to save the country 50 years ago, and they are fighting to save it again today, standing as broken heroes before a broken public. Brokenness is a theme that we find in the Mahzor. We find it in the Selichot section with this Aramaic line:

רְחָמָנָא דְעָנֵי לֹתְבִירִי לֹבָּא עְנֵינָן. רַחַמַנָא דְעָנֵי לִמְכִּיכִי רוּחָא עִנִינָן.

Here it is in Hebrew.

הָרְחֲמֶן הָעוֹנֶה לְשָׁבוּרֵי הַלֵּב עְנֵנוּ. הָרַחֲמֶן הָעוֹנֶה לֹנְמוֹכֵי הָרוֹחַ עָנֵנוּ.



May the Mericiful One who answers the brokenhearted answer us. May the Mericiful One who answers the downtrodden answer us.

We have similar Hebrew phrases for brokenhearted or broken of spirit in the book of Psalms and Isaiah.

קרוב הי	The LORD is close to the
ל <mark>ְנִשְׁבְּרֵי לֵב</mark>	<mark>brokenhearted</mark> ;
וְאֶת <mark>דַּכְּאֵי רוּחַ</mark>	those <mark>crushed in spirit</mark>
רוֹשִׁרעַ.	He delivers.
תה' לד:יט	Psalm 34:19
זָבְחֵי אֱלֹהִים <mark>רוּחַ</mark>	True sacrifice to God
<mark>נִשְׁבֶּרָה</mark> לֵב נִשְׁבָּר	is a <mark>broken spirit</mark> ;
וְ <mark>נִדְכֶּה</mark>	a <mark>broken heart</mark> , and <mark>crushed spirit</mark>
אֱלֹהִים	God,
לא תבְנָה.	you will not despise.
תה' נא:יט	Psalm 51:19
כִּי כֹה אָמֵר	For thus said the One
רָם וְנִשָּׂא שֹׁכֵן עַד	who high aloft forever dwells,
וְקָדוֹשׁ שְׁמוֹ	whose name is holy:
מָרוֹם וְקָדוֹשׁ	on high and in holiness
אֶשְׁכּוֹן	I dwell
ָוְאֶת <mark>דַּכָּא וּשְׁפַל</mark>	yet with the <mark>contrite</mark>
<mark>רוּת</mark> לְהַחֲיוֹת <mark>רוּת</mark>	and the <mark>lowly in spirit</mark> —
<mark>שְׁכָּלִים</mark> וּלְהַחֲיוֹת	reviving <mark>the spirits</mark>
ַלֵב נִדְּכָּאִים <mark>.</mark>	<mark>of the lowly</mark> ,
ישעהיו נז:טו	reviving the <mark>hearts</mark>
	<mark>of the contrite</mark> .
	Isaiah 57:15

The theme of brokenness resonates deeply in the spiritual life of every worshiper. Everyone is likely to feel broken at one time or another, certainly in the aftermath of loss or in a moment of societal turmoil. It is not difficult to see how this theme would inspire the theological reflections that we find in Psalms and Isaiah: God is close to the brokenhearted; God sees the supplication of the brokenhearted as a kind of sacrificial offering to which God responds lovingly; God revives those who are broken. Not surprisingly, the rabbis develop this theme in the following teachings.

Being a Broken Human Being is Kosher in God's Eyes

being a broken Human being is Kosner in Goa's Lyes			
אָמַר רַבִּי אַבָּא בַּר יוּדָן:	Rabbi Abba bar Yudan said:		
כָּל מַה שֶׁפָּסַל	All of the blemishes		
הַקָּדוֹשׁ בָּרוּךְ הוּא	that God disqualified for		
בּבְהֵמָה	sacrifice in animals		
	are blemishes that God affirms		
הָכְשִׁיר בְּאָדָם,	as acceptable in a human		
	being.		
	Those that God		
פָּסַל בִּבְהֵמָה:	disqualified among the animals		
אָנֶרֶת אוֹ <mark>שָׁבוּר</mark>	were: the blind or broken,		
אוֹ חֶרוּץ	or mutilated		
אוֹ יַבֶּלֶת	or [with] spotted-eye		
(ויקרא כב, כב)	(Lev. 22:22)		
וְהָכְשִׁיר	and those among human beings		
בְּאָדָם	that God affirmed as		
	acceptable, are ones with a		
לֵב נִשְׁבָּר	broken heart and		
וְנְדְכֶּה. (תהלים נא:יט)	a crushed spirit. (Psalm 51:19)		
ויקרא רבה ז:ב	Lev. Rabbah 7:2		

In Leviticus 22:20-24 we read that sacrificial animals were supposed to be blemish free. Animals that had deformities or broken limbs were not acceptable for sacrifice. Similarly, priests who were afflicted by the same list of blemishes as the unacceptable animals, were also disqualified from serving in the priesthood (Lev. 21:17-20). But is God interested in physical perfection? Or even emotional perfection, (if there is such a thing)? Not at all. Inspired by Isaiah and the Psalmist, Rabbi Abba bar Yudan points out that God cares deeply for the brokenhearted and broken of spirit. God desires our human imperfection not our human pretension to perfection.

God's Tools are Broken and That's Just Fine

אָמַר רַבִּי אָלֶכְּסַנְדְּרִי	Rabbi Alexandrai said:
הַהָּדְיוֹט הַנָּה	An ordinary person,
אָם מְשַׁמֵשׁ הוּא	if he uses
בְּכֵלִים שְבוּרִים	broken tools in his work,
גְּנַאי הוּא לוֹ,	shame on him,
אֲבָל הַקָּדוֹשׁ בָּרוּךְ הוּא	but the Blessed Holy One
בְּלֵי תַּשְׁמִישׁוֹ שְׁבוּרִים,	his tools are broken,
שָׁנָאֱמֵר:	as it is written:
קרוב ה'	God is close
לְנִשָּבָרִי לֵב,	to the brokenhearted;
(תהלים לד:יט)	(Psalm 34:19)
	God heals the brokenhearted

קרוֹפֵא לְשְׁבוּרֵי לָב, (תהלים קמז:ג) וְאֶת דַּכָּא וֹשְׁפַל רוּתַ. (ישעיה נז:טו) ויקרא רבה ז:ב (Psalm 147:3)

and with the contrite

and the lowly in spirit
(Isa. 57:15)

Lev. Rabbah 7:2

This remarkable teaching develops the theme further through the use of the metaphor that human beings are vessels, instruments, or tools of God. God uses human beings as tools to build or fix the world the way that an ordinary person uses a tool to build things or to fix things. While a broken hammer is a disgrace to a carpenter, a

broken-hearted human being elicits God's compassion and is a source of pride to God. As human beings, we are vessels of godliness. We have a divine spark within us, and our job in the world is to magnify that spark through acts of decency, kindness, generosity, compassion, and justice. As Jews, our role is to be vessels of God's name. But we are imperfect, flawed, and broken vessels. Yet that's just fine with God. While the ordinary carpenter needs a perfect hammer to complete a project, God is fine with a broken human to magnify God's presence and bring God's name into the world, and to be God's partner in completing creation.

A Little Liturgiology: A Very Short Study of this Beautiful Litany

מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְאַבְרָהָם אָבְינוּ בְּהַר הַמּוֹרִיָּה הוּא יַעְנֵנוּ:	Abraham our father on Mount Moriah
מי שֶׁעָנָה לְיִצְחָק בְּנוֹ כְּשֶׁנֶעֱקָד עַל גַּבֵּי הַמִּזְבֵּח הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	Isaac his son when he was bound on the altar
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְיַעֲקֹב בְּבֵית אֵל הוא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Jacob in Beit El
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְיוֹסַף בְּבֵית הָאֲסוּרִים הוּא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Joseph in the dungeon
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לַאֲבוֹתִינוּ עַל יַם סוף הוּא יַעְנֵנוּ:	Our ancestors at the Sea of Reeds
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְמשֶׁה בְּחוֹרֵב הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	Moses in Horev
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְאַהָרֹן בַּמַּחְתָּה הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	Aaron offering incense
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְפִינָחָס בְּקוּמוֹ מִתּוֹךְ הָעֵדָה הוּא יַעֲנְנוּ:	Pinhas when he got up from the crowd
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לִיהוֹשֻׁעַ בַּגּלְגָּל הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	Joshua at Gilgal
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְשָׁמוּאֵל בַּמִּצְפָּה הוּא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Samuel at Mitzpah
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְדָוִד וּשְׁלֹמֹה בְנוֹ בִּירוּשְׁלֵיִם הוא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	David and Solomon his son in Jerusalem
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְאֵלֹיֶהוּ בְּהַר הַכַּרְמֶל הוּא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Elijah at Mount Carmel
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לֶאֱלִישָׁע בִּירִיחוֹ הוּא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Elisha in Jericho
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְיוֹנָה בִמְעֵי הַדָּגָה הוּא יַעְנֵנו:	Jonah in the belly of the whale
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְחַזְּקֵיֶהוּ מֱלֶךְ יְהוּדָה בְּחָלְיוֹ, הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	Hizkiah king of Judah in his illness
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לַחַננְיָה מִישָׁאֵל וַעֲזְרָיָה בְּתוֹךְ כִּבְשֵׁן הָאֵשׁ הוּא יַעְנֵנוּ:	Hananya, Mishael, Azariah, in the fiery furnace
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְדָנִיֵּאל בְּגוֹב הָאֲרֶיוֹת הוא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Daniel in the lion's den
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְמָרְדְכֵי וְאֶסְתֵּר בְּשׁוּשֵׁן הַבִּירָה הוּא יַעֲנֵנוּ:	Mordecai and Esther in the capital Shushan
מִי שֶׁעָנָה לְעֶזְרָא בַגוֹלָה הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	Ezra in the diaspora
מי שֶׁעָנָה לְכָל הַצַּדִיקִים וְהַחְסִידִים וְהַתְּמִימִים וְהַיְשָׁרִים הוּא יַעֲנָנוּ:	All the righteous, pious, blameless, upright

This litany is part of the Maariv service of Yom Kippur, but is also found in the pre-High Holiday Selichot service. An early version of it is found in the Mishnah, tractate Ta'anit 2:4, and was included as part of prayers on court-decreed fast days during droughts and famines. It most likely originated in the Second Temple period and circulated in synagogues during that era. Originally, it consisted of only seven similar lines. In this order: 1. Abraham, 2. Our ancestors at the Sea of Reeds, 3. Joshua at Gilgal, 4. Samuel at Mitzpah, 5. Elijah on Mount Carmel, 6. Jonah in the belly of the whale, and 7. David and Solomon in Jerusalem. The classic version above has 20 lines; the one in our Mahzor has 17; the editors added several female biblical personalities (Sarah, Rebekah, Leah, Rachel, the Hebrew Midwives, Yocheved, Miriam, and the Daughters of Tzelofhad) and deleted several male personalities from the version above. The intent of the earliest version of this prayer was to get God to answer us, most likely, with the miracle of rainfall to prevent famine, similar to all the miraculous interventions that God had performed in the past:

intervening in the Akedah, splitting the Sea of Reeds, the splitting the Jordan River, etc. But as this prayer evolved, with its additional biblical personalities, its intent evolved as well. We are no longer calling for a specific miracle, but on the Days of Awe we are simply calling to be heard and to be forgiven. As we recite this litany, we are rapidly filing through the entire biblical story of Israel from Abraham all the way to Ezra, pretty much in chronological order, and then making the leap to the rest of Jewish history with the last line, "all the righteous, pious, blameless, upright souls who have been answered." They are, of course, too numerous to name. But that line serves as a springboard for own imaginative leaps to consider historical figures that are important to us, as well as people in our own lives who may have experienced some kind of deliverance or extraordinary fortune. The power of a litany lies in the constant repetition. The satisfaction we get from reciting this prayer is feeling that we have surveyed 4000 years of our history in about two minutes, which is how it elapsed for God! We hope that God will be attentive to us for the next 4000 years!