## Comments on Some of Moses' Last Words Rabbi Eliot Malomet September 9, 2023 23 Elul 5783

are the first words Parashat Vayelekh. But is this text correct? נְיָלֵדְ מֹשֶׁה means he went. This refers, of course, to Moses who went. But the text doesn't tell us where he went. Exactly where was Moses going? And on top of it, in the very next verse, we read that he can no longer go anywhere!

Welcome to the world of the critical study of the Bible. The traditional text that we have in front of us is called the Masoretic Text. This became the authoritative text. But ancient translations of the Bible, most notably the Greek translation known as the Septuagint (LXX), and other ancient manuscripts of the Bible, most notably the Dead Sea Scrolls (DSS), sometimes have significant variants from the Masoretic Text. This is the case with Deut. 31:1. In both the LXX and the DSS, instead of יילד, it says, ייכל (the ב and the ל are reversed). Which version is right? יילד of the Masoretic Text or ייכל of the DSS and the LXX? There is a strong case to be made for יובל, which means, And Moses finished. Robert Alter explains that the order of the last two consonants could easily have been reversed in a scribal transcription. Richard Friedman points out that this is a nice wordplay: ריבל-he finished sounds a lot like לא אוכל -I am not able in the next verse. At this point in the book, Moses has indeed *finished* all of his major discourses, so this variant makes a lot of sense. Moreover, ייבל is a word that we recognize from other key moments of completion in the Torah, namely when God <mark>finishes</mark> creating the world: וְיַבַל אֱלֹהִים בַּיּוֹם הַשְּׁבִיעִי מְלַאכִתּוֹ אַשֵּר עשה וַיִּשְבַּת -God had finished, on the seventh day, his work that he had made, and he rested. (Gen. 2:2); and



when Moses *finishes* the work of the sanctuary: וְיַכֵּל מֹשֶׁה -And Moses finished the work (Exod. 40:33). In our next Parasha, Ha'azinu, the word יִיכָּל מֹשֶׁה occurs again, this time as Moses *finishes* his last poetic address to the people: אָת מְשָׁה לְדַבֶּר אֶת כָּל הַדְּבָרִים הָאֵלָה אֶל כָּל יִשְׂרָאַל -And Moses finished speaking all these words to all Israel. (Deut. 32:45). Therefore, some scholars think that יֵיכֶלְּה is an error.

The word מוסף also signals to the reader/listener that we are at a major turning point. Just as there is no going back from Creation and the completion of the sanctuary, there is no going back here as well. With the completion of Moses' words, like the completion of a great symphony, we get a feeling of tremendous pathos. Moses' main accomplisment is done and now all that is left before his passing are some parting words of blessing. All of Jewish history will unfold from this pivotal moment.

## On לְצֵאת וְלְבוֹץ: Going Out and Coming In.

When Moses says, לא אוּכָל עוֹד לְצֵאת וְלָבוֹא -I am no longer able to go out and to come in we tend to think that he is simply making an observation about his old-age. After all, he was 120 years old! But in a couple of chapters, the Torah specifically remarks that he was pretty fit for his age: וּמֹשֵה בָּן מֵאָה וְעֶשִׂרִים שָׁנָה בְּמֹתוֹ לֹא כָהַתָּה עֵינוֹ וְלֹא נָס לֵחֹה -Now Moshe was a hundred and twenty years old at his death; his eye had not grown-dim, his vigor had not fled. Clearly, he was not blind and not lame. Rashi tries to resolve the contradiction. Even though he was still *physically able* to lead, he was not divinely authorized to lead: שנטלה ממני הרשות ונתנה ליהושע-because the prerogative of leadership was taken away from me and given to Joshua. Alternatively, Rashi says, he no longer had the right to impart Torah or wisdom because: שֵנְסָתְמוּ מְמֵנוּ מְסוֹרוֹת וּמְעִינוֹת הַחָכְמֵה the traditions and fountains of wisdom were capped from him. In other words, according to Rashi, Moses is saying: I no longer have political or spiritual authority over you. He is, quite literally, incapacitated. He no longer has the capacity to lead. He can't come and go as he once did.

For other commentators, this phrase is a specific term for military leadership. For example, Joshua uses the exact same phrase when he gives a kind of valedictory address upon completing many battles. He is 85 years old and: עוֹדֵנִי הַיּוֹם חַזָק כַּאֲשֵׁר בִּיוֹם שָׁלֹחַ אוֹתִי מֹשֵׁה כְּכֹחִי אֲז וּכְכֹחִי עַתָּה לַמְּלְחַמָּה <mark>וַלְצֵאת וַלְבוֹא - I am still as strong today as on</mark> the day of Moshe's sending me—as my might was then, so my might is now for battle, for going out and for **coming in**. Robert Alter comments that it should be translated: I can no longer sally forth and come in. It is an apt phrase for Moses to use because Joshua, whom he is about to designate as his successor, figures above all as the military commander of the conquest. In other words, Moses is either saying, Even though I'm still strong, I'm not strong enough to lead you in battle, or Even though I'm still capable, I've been decommissioned, and I am no

longer authorized by God to lead you in the next phase of our lives, which is the conquest of Canaan.

As we know, there is more than one way of reading the Bible, and the joy of Torah study is being able to appreciate multiple layers of meaning at the same time. It's hard to read לא אוכל עוד לְצַאַת וְלְבוֹא without thinking about another occurrence of this pairing in the preceding parasha, Ki Tavo: בְּרוּךְ אַתָּה בְּבַאַת וְּבְּרוּךְ אַתָּה בְּבַאַת וּלְבוּ אַתָּה בְּבַאַת עוֹש be when you come in and blessed will you be when you go out (Deut. 28:6). It is very plausible that that verse could also be referring to military achievement, after all, it says right afterwards, Your enemies will be routed before you. But it's also pretty clear that בְּרוּךְ אַתָּה בְּבַאַתְּ וְבָרוּךְ אַתָּה בְּבַאַת נוֹש be in the town and blessed you will be in the field. Blessed the fruit of your womb and blessed the fruit of your soil, etc. Blessed when you enter; blessed when you exit, ie. at every juncture.

Turn to Psalm 121 and you find this: הי ישמר מְעַהָּה וְעַד עוֹלְם-May God guard your going and **coming**, now and forever. While that Psalm could certainly apply to a someone about to go to war, when we read it, we construe it in the broadest and most figurative sense: life is a journey, and throughout the course of a life there are many comings and goings. Psalm 121 is the go-to Psalm for all pivotal moments: milestones, graduations, sickness, travel, the end of Shabbat, the end of a year and the beginning of a new year, and of course the ultimate journey from life to beyond life. The phrase צאתר ובואר -going and coming, is common enough to not require much interpretation. But when Moses says it at the end of his life, he is recognizing that despite all of his gifts, he no longer has a free range of movement. There is an actual geographic border that he cannot cross, the Jordan river, and there is also an actual temporal border before him, a boundary which he cannot cross as well. I am no longer free to come and go as I please. I cannot live beyond my final moment, the final boundary. I now inhabit the final zone of my life, in time and space, and I cannot break out of that zone. I must face the inevitable fact of my mortality.

One more item ought to intrigue us. We should recall that at the beginning of the Torah, as human lives extend into several centuries, (see under: Methuselah, 969 years!) God decreed that the human lifespan will no longer exceed 120 years. ניאמר הי לא יַדוֹן רוּחִי בַאָּדָם לְעֹלָם בְּשַׁגַּם הוא בשר ומיו מאה ועשרים שנה-And God said, "My breath shall not abide in the human forever, for his but flesh, Let his days be a hundred and twenty years." (Gen. 6:3). What a coincidence! Here, Moses remarks that he is 120 years old! It is one thing that Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob live to 175, 180 and 147 years of age respectively. But Moses, the man of Torah, the person most closely linked to the Torah and its laws, if Moses himself didn't live up to the Torah's prescription of the lifespan, then, ironically, he would be undermining the entire Torah that he wanted everybody else to uphold! In stating his age, Moses therefore is performing a final act of validation. He validates the Torah,

and he validates God's original plan for humanity, which was stated all the way back at the beginning of the Torah.

Moshe wrote down this Instruction מוֹתְנָה אֵל הַכֹּהְנִים and gave it to the priests, the Sons of Levi, those carrying the Coffer of the Covenant of God, ואל כל זקני ישראל. and to all the elders of Israel. וַיְצֵו מֹשֶה אוֹתָם And Moshe commanded them, saving: מקץ שבע שנים At the end of seven years, at the appointed-time שנת השמטה of the Year of Release, on the pilgrimage-festival of Sukkot, when all Israel comes to be seen אָת פְּנֵי הי אֱלֹהֶיךְ at the presence of the Lord your God, at the place that he chooses, אָת הַתּוֹרָה הַזֹּאַת you are to proclaim this Instruction נגד כָּל ישרָאֵל in front of all Israel, in their hearing. Deut. 31:9-11 דברים לא:ט-יא

In light of everything that we said above regarding Moses and the recognition of his mortality, and in light of all the times that he complained about not being able to go into the land with the people, we have to give him credit for figuring out at least one clever way that he will accompany the people: with words. Moses may not *literally* make it into the land, but he guaranties that he will make it in, *literarily*! By writing his words and entrusting the document to the custodians of all the holy things, the priests, and by instructing them to read the document to the people every seven years at the Temple on Sukkot, Moses ensured that some part of him will actually be there with them. He might not make it into the land, but his words definitely will.

Many have pointed out that this the nucleus of the Oral Torah. After all, if the Torah is going to be read publicly, somebody listening is inevitably going have to explain it. And so begins the conversation: the Oral Torah.

But sometime after Ezra, Jews discovered that once every seven years was not enough for a public reading, so the entire Torah was divided into weekly portions, and here we are every week, reading it, studying it, and participating in Oral Torah, the eternal conversation about Moses' words. While he didn't make it into the land, his words outlasted him and will continue to spark conversation forever.



An aside: When the great Yiddish writer, Sholem Aleichem died in 1916, he left instructions in his will for his family and friends to gather on his yahrzeit: "Read my will," he wrote, "and also select one of my stories, one of the very

merry ones, and recite it in whatever language is most intelligible to you. Let my name be recalled with laughter, or not at all." He, like Moses, understood that words have power to outlive us. It's a lovely lesson for us all. Why not write down your own words and live on through them?

Shabbat Shalom! שַבת שֵׁלוֹם!